



## CITY OF SAINT PAUL

Christopher B. Coleman, Mayor

25 West Fourth Street  
Saint Paul, MN 55102Telephone: 651-266-6700  
Facsimile: 651-228-3220

Date: October 6, 2011 – REVISED FROM September 20, 2011 staff report

To: Comprehensive Planning Committee

From: Penelope Simison – [penelope.simison@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:penelope.simison@ci.stpaul.mn.us) or 651/266-6554

Subject: Industrial Zoning Study – preliminary staff recommendations

This memo describes preliminary staff recommendations for amendments to the industrial use list and Zoning Code sections pertaining to industrial uses.

The industrial zoning study was authorized in the adopted *Saint Paul Comprehensive Plan*; specifically, Policies 2.21, 2.22, and 2.23 of the Land Use chapter; the regulation section of the Land Use chapter is attached.

Background

The City's Zoning Code historically has permitted a wide variety of non-industrial uses in industrial districts. Although this model has long been used in many cities, it was challenged in the last decade or more as developers around the country constructed housing in industrial districts, finding that industrial land was cheaper than residentially-zoned land and the rate of return on the residential investment was higher than for industrial uses. While this phenomenon was not widespread in Saint Paul, it did prompt discussions on how the Zoning Code could be strengthened to protect industrial land for its intended purposes of economic activity and a strong employment base while, at the same time, reflecting the complexities of developing industrial land in an older, urban area. The zoning study is intended to deal with these issues.

Scope of the study

The over-arching goal of the study is to protect and enhance the city's employment base. To achieve that goal, the study has focused on the following issues:

- The industrial use list. The issues is whether some non-industrial uses are, or are not, compatible with industry.
- Residential uses in an industrial district.
- Design standards.
- Minor text amendments. These are largely in response to Determination of Similar Use analyses written by staff from PED and the Department of Safety and Inspections.

### **Revision of the Industrial use list**

Some uses clearly do not support the primary objectives of an industrial district, including economic activity and employment, and it may be prudent that they be deleted from the use list. Others are suggested additions, reflecting staff determinations of similar use and other analyses of zoning inquiries.

The industrial use list with proposed amendments is attached.

### **Design standards**

When the IR district was adopted in 2005, it was intended "to provide sites for commercial, office and light industrial uses that are compatible with any nearby parks, parkways, or residential uses." (Section 66.511)

To that end, restrictions were put in place to achieve that compatibility, including placement of parking and design standards. For the design standards, some of the TN design standards considered applicable to industrial buildings and sites were approved for industrial development.

Since then, questions have been raised about the direct applicability of these TN design standards for industrial development. Most often, issues arose when a proposed industrial development was submitted for site plan review. It was often difficult for the typical industrial building to comply with the TN design standards adopted for the IR district.

At the same time, it was acknowledged that the City has a clear interest in facilitating industrial development in an urban environment that fits within the fabric of the larger community, whether that be residential and/or commercial development. The City has long expressed the commitment to development that is human scaled, even when the sites are large enough to accommodate semi-trailer trucks and buildings have clear heights for large manufacturing or processing equipment.

Staff proposes the following design standards (attached) that would apply to the IR district and, in some instances, to the I1 district:

### **Residential uses in industrial districts**

The Zoning Code in Saint Paul (as in many other cities) has always allowed residential uses in industrial zones. Since 1975 it has been limited to mixed residential and commercial uses, and some congregate residential facilities. During the last 20 years, developers in many cities have acquired industrial properties for residential development in locations where the land may be worth more for residential development than for industrial development. One result of such development activities is a loss of industrial land for industrial purposes. At the same time, there has been interest, particularly on the part of incubator business owners and owners of such niche businesses as web designers, architects, and the like, of living and working in the same space. The study attempts to address those needs without permitting residential uses as standalone units or without putting into place code provisions that allow a diminution of the amount of industrially-zoned land.

The proposed revision to Sec. 65.143 permits mixed use in the IR, I1, and I2 districts, with limits on the number of residential units in each building.

**Sec. 65.143. Mixed residential and commercial use.**

*Standards and conditions in B1-B3 business and IR-I2 industrial districts:*

- (a) In B1-B3 business and IR industrial districts, residential uses shall be limited to not more than fifty (50) percent of the basement and first floor and fifty (50) percent of a basement. The entire upper floors may be used for residential use. At least fifty (50) percent of the basement and first floor and fifty (50) percent of a basement shall be devoted to a principal commercial, civic, and/or institutional uses permitted in this the district, other than residential uses.
- (b) In I1-I2 industrial districts, dwelling units shall not be located in the basement or first floor, and a conditional use permit is required for a mixed residential and commercial use with more than six (6) dwelling units. At least eighty (80) percent of the first floor shall be devoted to principal uses permitted in the district, other than residential uses.

**Notes:**

For I1-I2, this prohibits dwelling units in a basement. Parking is permitted in a basement. For I1-I2, this use would be changed from "P" to "P/C" in Table 66.521, Principal Uses in Industrial Districts. The key finding for a conditional use permit is that "the extent, location and intensity of the use will be in substantial compliance with the Saint Paul Comprehensive Plan and any subarea plans which were approved by the city council." The comprehensive plan and subarea plans could be very clear about how much this use should be limited or restricted in a particular area. The amendments make it clear that the percentage requirements in B1-B3 and IR districts do not apply to the first floor and a basement combined, but to each separately.

**Minor text amendments for Industrial code sections**

These include intermediate metal shredder, hazardous waste recycling transfer facility, building code requirements for required setbacks, and correction of zoning code names for specified districts.

1. Metal shredder, intermediate – proposed development standards for use:  
**Secs. 65.833—65.839. 838- Reserved.**

**Sec. 65.839. Metal shredder, intermediate.**

A facility that accepts, stores and shreds intermediately sized metal products, including crushed and logged motor vehicles cut into smaller sections. The facility shall be incapable of handling whole crushed motor vehicles, closed containers and heavy-dense scrap with a thickness of more than ¼ inch.

*Standards and conditions:*

- (a) Facilities for motor vehicle recycling shall be located on the site of an existing legal motor vehicle salvage operation.
- (b) The size of the intermediate shredder intake shall be 60 inches by 60 inches or less and the power generated by the shredder shall be 1500 horsepower or less.

- (c) All processing activities and material storage shall be contained within enclosed buildings that meet all the requirements of the State Building Code.
- (d) The intermediate shredder facility shall meet noise standards as set forth in MPCA (Minnesota Pollution Control Agency) Noise Pollution Control Rules and local ordinances. The applicant shall perform a noise analysis to determine whether the facility will conform to the rules and regulations and propose any mitigation measures necessary to meet the rules and regulations. Buildings shall be insulated as required by the State Building Code and sound proofed as required by the noise analysis.
- (e) The intermediate shredder shall be equipped with a closed loop dust collection system or similar system to ensure safe indoor and outdoor air quality. The applicant shall prepare an air quality analysis showing how air quality will be in compliance with state, federal, and local rules and regulations.
- (f) The applicant shall provide a traffic analysis identifying automobile and truck trips, peak hour trips, and potential impacts on existing transportation systems. Intermediate shredders shall not be permitted in any instance where negative impacts on the existing transportation system cannot be mitigated by the applicant.
- (g) Vehicular access to the intermediate shredder shall not include local or collector streets that also provide vehicular access to residential uses, schools, churches or hospitals.
- (h) The applicant shall prepare an evaluation of surrounding subsurface soils, utilities, and surrounding buildings to determine the likelihood of adverse vibration issues, and shall design a foundation and footing system to address any issues that are discovered.
- (i) The applicant shall prepare a surface and ground water quality analysis that complies with state, local, and federal regulations regarding stormwater pollution prevention and groundwater quality.
- (j) Intermediate shredders shall be no closer than one thousand (1,000) feet to a residentially zoned property or property used for a residence, school, church, temple, or hospital.
- (k) Hours of operation may be limited where needed to protect the health, welfare, and tranquility of nearby uses.
- (l) A site plan and supporting documentation showing how the proposed intermediate shredder complies with all these conditions shall be submitted with the application and prior to planning commission consideration of the conditional use permit.

2. Hazardous waste recycling facility – proposed development standards:

Sec. 65.830 829. Hazardous waste processing facility.

[Renumbered this up one to reduce subsequent renumbering and because there were 5 numbers available between Greenhouse and the Hazardous, while there were only 7 numbers between Infectious and Metal to accommodate all potential J, K, and L uses.]

Sec. 65.830. Hazardous waste recycling transfer facility.

A facility that collects recyclable hazardous and industrial non-hazardous wastes from very small quantity generators (VSQG), as defined in Minnesota Rules 7045.0320, and consolidates these wastes into larger containers that meet minimum shipment requirements (generally 55 gallon drums), and transfers them to an appropriate processing facility within ten (10) days of receipt.

[definition basically from the use as described in the DSU application approved by the Planning Commission on December 19, 2003. Ten-day maximum is in state law according to the applicants, so is included in the definition rather than as a condition.]

Standards and conditions:

- (a) The use shall be located at least 300 feet from residentially zoned land.
- (b) The facility shall meet all state requirements of a VSQG collection site, including a license issued by the Saint Paul-Ramsey County Department of Public Health.
- (c) The facility shall document the safety of any outdoor storage of collected materials.
- (d) The facility shall collect the waste or shall ensure that customers are trained to safely transport the material to the facility.
- (e) The facility shall not accept or collect household hazardous waste or explosive, radioactive, infectious, or putrescible materials.
- (f) The facility shall be kept free of litter and any other undesirable materials and cleaned of loose debris on a daily basis.

[These seem to be they key standards from the conditions listed by the Planning Commission in the DSU.]

3. It is useful to reference the building code setback requirements, which depend on the type of construction and wall openings. The amendments to Table 66.531 incorporate reference to the building code requirements into the industrial dimensional standards table, similar to language in notes to the business district dimensional standard table.

Table 66.531. Industrial District Dimensional Standards

Zoning District	Floor Area Ratio (FAR)	Height Maximum		Yard Setbacks Minimum (feet)		
	Maximum	Stories	Feet	Front	Side	Rear
IR light industrial restricted	2.0	3(a),(b)	50(a),(b)	0(c),(d),(e),(f),(g)	0(c),(e),(g),(f)	0(c),(g),(f)
I1 light industrial	2.0	(b)	50(b)	0(c),(d),(e),(f),(g)	0(c),(e),(g),(f)	0(c),(g),(f)
I2 General industrial	3.0	(b)	75(b)	0(c),(d),(e),(f),(g)	0(c),(e),(g),(f)	0(c),(g),(f)
I3 Restricted industrial	1.0	(b)	75(b)	0(c),(d),(e),(f),(g)	0(c),(e),(g),(f)	0(c),(g),(f)

Notes to table 66.531, industrial district dimensional standards:

- (a) Buildings exceeding this height limit, to a maximum height of seventy-five (75) feet, may be permitted with a conditional use permit.
- (b) The height of the structure may exceed the maximum building height allowed in the district provided the structure is set back from all exterior property lines of the parcel a distance equal to the height which said structure exceeds the maximum building height allowed in the district.
- (c) On those lots or parcels, or portions of lots or parcels, which are located directly across a street or abut a side or rear lot line in any use district other than an IR, I-1, I-2, I-3, or PV district, the required setbacks from said abutting districts shall be equal to a minimum of one and one-half (1 1/2) times the height of the buildings, except as noted in section 63.102.
- (d) On those lots or parcels, or portions of lots or parcels, which adjoin a right-of-way line of a parkway, the required setbacks from the parkway right-of-way line shall be equal to that required for residential uses in

effect along the parkway right-of-way or twenty-five (25) feet, whichever is greater. The following parkways and portions of parkways are excluded from this setback requirement: Ford Parkway (from Kenneth Street to Finn Street and north side between Finn Street and Mississippi River Boulevard), Gannon Road, and Lexington Parkway (from Pierce Butler Route to the nearest Burlington Northern Railroad tracks).

- (e) No side or rear yards are required along interior lot lines, except as specified in the building code.
- (f) (e) Where the frontage of any block is divided into two (2) or more zoning districts, the front yard requirements of the district with the largest front yard depth shall be applied to the entire block frontage.
- (g) (f) Nonrequired front yards and all required and nonrequired side and rear yards shall be permitted to be used for off-street parking. Loading and unloading shall not be permitted in any required front, side or rear yards.

4. Correct zoning district names in Section 66.531.

**Sec. 66.531. Density and dimensional standards table.**

- (c) On those lots or parcels, or portions of lots or parcels, which are located directly across a street or abut a side or rear lot line in any use district other than an IR, I-1, I-2, I-3, or PV 11, 12, 13, or VP district, the required setbacks from said abutting districts shall be equal to a minimum of one and one-half (1 1/2) times the height of the buildings, except as noted in section 63.102.

**Staff note regarding congregate facilities and on-going study:**

The proposed amendments to the industrial use list do not affect several categories of congregate residential uses. A study is underway regarding **inconsistencies between City zoning classifications and state regulations governing community residential facilities**, including "community residential facility, licensed correctional," "community residential facility, health department licensed," "correctional facility," "emergency housing facility," "overnight shelter," "shelter for battered persons," "transitional housing facility," "roominghouse, boardinghouse," and "hospice." The extent to which these facilities remain on the industrial use list, or are deleted, await that study's conclusions.



**2.20 Seek clarification from the Minnesota Legislature on the language of Minnesota Statutes 242 and 469 to improve the process of transferring tax forfeit properties between Ramsey County and the City and/or the Housing and Redevelopment Authority. §**

Currently the City and the Housing Redevelopment Authority have the right of first refusal on all tax forfeit properties either for public use or for redevelopment purposes. Changes in state legislation are needed to define more clearly the issues resulting from varying interpretations of the statutes that affect both the process and transfer issues; the objective is to streamline the process so it is more effective and efficient.

**REGULATION**

The *Saint Paul Zoning Code* is both strategic and flexible in its approach to how land in industrial districts is used. It permits a wide variety of manufacturing and other industrial uses. Contrary to the stated intentions of industrial districts, many non-industrial uses are also permitted. Practically, industrial districts have been designed to accommodate businesses and facilities that might not be welcome in other areas of the city. There are concerns that industrial land will be developed with non-industrial uses, which often produce a higher rate of return on an investment than industrial uses. In response, many cities prohibit residential uses in industrial areas; others do not prohibit non-industrial uses but limit their size and number and require that they be subject to discretionary review. The policies in this section are intended to facilitate the stability of Saint Paul's industrial and employment base.

**2.21 Prepare regulations for conditional use review of specified uses (to be identified in a study of principal uses permitted in industrial districts) for the purposes of ensuring compatibility of non-industrial uses with the primary industrial function of the district and of protecting the employment base. §**

Some non-industrial uses are compatible with industrial uses, while other permitted uses may weaken the industrial character of the district and its employment base. The study is intended to determine how conditional use review for specified uses will be used to protect the industrial character of these districts. It will address the following issues:

- Maintenance of the city's industrial employment base;
- Benefits to existing and future industrial uses;
- Significant adverse impacts on nearby industrial uses; and
- Significant alterations to the overall industrial character of the area, based on the existing proportion of industrial and non-industrial uses and on the effects of incremental change.

**2.22 Revise the list of principal uses permitted in industrial districts to ensure compatibility with the primary industrial function of the district for the purpose of protecting the employment base. §**

The *Saint Paul Zoning Code* permits a wide range of non-industrial uses in industrial districts. Non-industrial uses undermine the viability of the industrial



Saint Paul's location as a transportation, manufacturing, and distribution center for the northwestern United States for more than 100 years, and the downsizing of many of these businesses, has left the city with a large amount of contaminated property. Since the 1980s approximately 1,000 acres of brownfields have been investigated, cleaned up, and redeveloped by the City and the Port Authority for light industrial, commercial, and residential uses. This effort has resulted in approximately 4,000 jobs at firms operating on redeveloped brownfields and a significant property tax base increase. Remediation and redevelopment of brownfields in Saint Paul is far from done. Local, state, and federal programs to remediate brownfields, developed during the last 20 years, have been effective but they are also complex and under-funded. Public financial and programmatic assistance is necessary to overcome the extra cost and perception problems associated with the remediation and reuse of brownfields.

sector and the city's employment base. The study will determine how the list of principal uses can be revised to strengthen the industrial sector.

**2.23 Establish site plan review standards for the I1, I2, and I3 districts for the purposes of providing for the efficient use of land and enhancing the aesthetic quality of the district. ✕ \$**

TN development standards incorporated into the IR district enhance the appearance and functionality of an industrial development so the district is compatible with nearby commercial and residential areas. Efficient use of a parcel will yield greater numbers of jobs for each acre of development than inefficient use.

**BROWNFIELDS REMEDIATION**

Brownfields are abandoned, idled, or under-utilized industrial and commercial properties. Brownfields should be remediated before they can be redeveloped because of actual or suspected environmental contamination. Industrial buildings and property, rail yards, petroleum tank farms, old dumps, dry cleaning establishments, printing establishments, and painting establishments, often become brownfields. Because of the cost of cleanup, many brownfields remain undeveloped. Redevelopment of a brownfields site is more expensive than development on uncontaminated property because of the investigation and cleanup obligation.

The social and economic vitality of a city, especially employment opportunities for its residents, is adversely affected if underdeveloped or vacant properties are not redeveloped, while the redevelopment of brownfields restores and enhances a city's employment and property tax base. An additional benefit of brownfields redevelopment is the reuse of existing infrastructure capacity.

**2.24 Create a brownfields redevelopment group within the Department of Planning and Economic Development (PED).**

The brownfields redevelopment group will do the following: \$

- a. Prepare an inventory of brownfields sites. To assemble the inventory, the brownfields redevelopment group will use information in databases assembled by the Minnesota Pollution Control Agency (PCA) and the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), as well as Sanborn maps describing how buildings and sites were used historically;
- b. Prepare a brownfields redevelopment strategic plan that includes a comprehensive approach to remediation and redevelopment of brownfields; the strategic plan will include, but not be limited to, applications for funding from local, state, and federal agencies, as well as tools for redevelopment and remediation using cost effective means, particularly leveraging development financing by the private sector;
- c. Provide developers and property owners, particularly those not aware of financial and programmatic assistance available for brownfields redevelopment, with information about

**Table 66.521. Principal Uses in Industrial Districts**

Use	IR	I1	I2	I3	Development Standards
<b>Residential Uses</b>					
<i>Mixed Commercial-Residential Uses</i>					
Home occupation	P	P	P		✓
Mixed residential and commercial use	P	P/C	P/C		✓
<b>Congregate Living</b>					
Foster home, freestanding foster care home	P	P	P		✓
Community residential facility, licensed human service	P	P	P		✓
Community residential facility, licensed correctional		C	C		✓
Community residential facility, health department licensed		C	C		✓
Correctional facility		C	P	€	
Emergency housing facility		C	C		✓
Overnight shelter		C	C		✓
Shelter for battered persons	P	P	P		✓
Transitional housing facility	P	P	P		✓
Sober house	P/C	P/C	P/C		✓
Roominghouse, boardinghouse			C		✓
Hospice	P	P	P		✓
<b>Civic and Institutional Uses</b>					
<i>Educational Facilities</i>					
Group day care	P	P	P		✓
School, grades K-12	P	P	P		
College, university, seminary, etc.	P	P	P		✓
Trade school, arts school, dance school, etc.	P	P	P		
<i>Social, Cultural, and Recreational Facilities</i>					
Club, fraternal organization, lodge hall	P	P	P		
Public Library	P	P	P		
Public and private park, playground	P	P	P		
Recreation, noncommercial	P	P	P		
<i>Religious Institutions</i>					
Church, chapel, synagogue, place of worship	P	P	P		
Rectory, parsonage	P	P	P		
Convent, monastery, religious retreat	P	P	P		
<b>Public Services and Utilities</b>					
Antenna, cellular telephone	P/€	P/€	P	P	✓
Antenna, public utility microwave	C	C	P	P	✓
Antenna, radio and television transmitting	C	C	P	P	✓
Antenna, satellite dish	C	C	P	P	✓
Electric transformer or gas regulator substation	P	P	P	P	
Municipal building or use	P	P	P		
Municipal incinerator			P	P	

Use	IR	I1	I2	I3	Development Standards
Power plant			P	P	
Public utility heating or cooling plant		P	P	P	
Public works yard or maintenance facility		P	P	P	
Sewage treatment plant			P	P	
Utility or public service building or yard	P	P	P	P	
Water supply plant	P	P	P	P	
Yard waste site, commercial and municipal		C	C	P	✓
<b>Commercial Uses</b>					
<b>Offices</b>					
Administrative office	P	P	P		
Artist, photographer studio, etc.	P	P	P		
Insurance office, real estate office, sales office	P	P	P		
Professional office	P	P	P		
<b>Medical Facilities</b>					
Clinic, medical or dental	P	P	P		
Hospital	P	P	P		
Medical laboratory	P	P	P		
Veterinary clinic	P	P	P		✓
<b>Retail Sales and Services</b>					
General retail	P	P	P		
Alternative financial establishment		C	P		✓
Bank, credit union	P	P	P		
Business sales and services	P	P	P		
Drive-through sales and services, primary and accessory	P	P	P		✓
Dry cleaning, commercial laundry	P	P	P		
Food and related goods sales	P	P	P		
Food shelf	P	P	P		
Garden center, outdoor	P	P	P		✓
Greenhouse	P	P	P		✓
Gun shop, shooting gallery		C	P	P	✓
Laundromat, self-service	P	P	P		
Liquor store	P	P	P		
Massage center	P	P	P		
Mortuary, funeral home		P	P		
Outdoor uses, commercial		C	P		✓
Outdoor uses, commercial sales of consumer fireworks		C	C		✓
Package delivery service	P	P	P		
Pawn shop		C	P		✓
Photocopying	P	P	P		
Post office	P	P	P		
Service business	P	P	P		
Service business with showroom or workshop	P	P	P		
Small appliance repair	P	P	P		
Small engine repair, automotive bench work	P	P	P		
Tattoo shop	P	P	P		
Tobacco products shop	P	P	P		✓

Use	IR	I1	I2	I3	Development Standards
<b><i>Food and Beverages</i></b>					
Brew on premises store	P	P	P		
Catering	P	P	P		
Coffee kiosk	P	P	P		✓
Coffee shop, tea house	P	P	P		
Restaurant	P	P	P		
Restaurant, carry-out-deli	P	P	P		
Restaurant, fast food	P/C	P	P		✓
Restaurant, outdoor	P	P	P		✓
<b><i>Commercial Recreation, Entertainment and Lodging</i></b>					
Bed and breakfast residence	P	P	P		
Bingo hall, auction hall	P	P	P		
Health/sports club	P	P	P		
Hotel, inn, motel	P	P	P		
Indoor recreation	P	P	P		✓
Outdoor (drive-in) theater sports/entertainment		C	P	P	✓
Race track		C	P	P	
Reception hall	P	P	P		
Steam room/bathhouse facility	P	P	P		
Theater, assembly hall, concert hall	P	P	P		
<b><i>Adult Entertainment</i></b>					
Adult use		C	C		✓
<b><i>Automobile Services</i></b>					
Auto body shop	C	P	P	P	✓
Auto convenience market	C	P	P		✓
Auto service station	C	P	P		✓
Auto specialty store	C	P	P		✓
Auto repair station	C	P	P		✓
Auto sales, indoor	P	P	P		
Auto sales and rental, outdoor	C	P	P		✓
Car wash		P	P		✓
<b><i>Parking facilities</i></b>					
Parking facility, commercial	C	P	P	C	✓
<b><i>Transportation</i></b>					
Airport		C	C	C	
Bus garage, station, lot, or turnaround		P	P	C	
Heliport		C	C	C	✓
Helistop	C	C	C	C	✓
Intermodal freight yard			C	C	✓
Motor freight terminal			C	C	✓
Railroad right-of-way, transfer and storage tracks	P	P	P	P	
Railroad station or terminal freight facility	P	P	P	C	
Railroad yard or shop	C	C	P	P	
Taxi dispatching, maintenance and storage		P	P	P	

Use	IR	I1	I2	I3	Development Standards
<b>Limited Production, Processing and Storage</b>					
Finishing shop	P	P	P		✓
Limited production and processing	P	P	P		✓
Mail order house	P	P	P		
Malt liquor production	P	P	P		
Plastic products	P	P	P		
Printing and publishing	P	P	P		
Recycling collection center		P	P		✓
Recycling drop-off station	P	P	P		✓
Storage facility, rental		P	P	P	
Toiletries and cosmetic manufacturing	P	P	P		
Warehousing and storage	P	P	P		
Wholesale establishment	P	P	P		
<b>Industrial Uses</b>					
Light manufacturing	P	P	P	C	
General industrial			P	P	
General outdoor processing			C	C	✓
Brewery, micro and regional	P	P	P		
Brewery, national			P		
Cement, asphalt cement, and asphalt manufacturing			C	C	✓
Concrete, asphalt and rock crushing facility				C	✓
Crematorium		P	P	P	
Greenhouse, industrial	P	P	P		
Hazardous waste processing facility			C	C	✓
Hazardous waste recycling transfer facility			C	C	✓
Infectious waste incinerator				C	✓
Infectious waste processing facility			C	C	✓
Lumber yard	P	P	P		
Metal shredder, intermediate			C	P	✓
Mining			C	C	
Motor vehicle salvage operation			C	C	✓
Petroleum and gasoline tank farms				P	
Recycling processing center, indoor		P	P	P	✓
Recycling processing center, outdoor			C	C	✓
Rendering plants and tanning				P	
Research, development and testing laboratory	P	P	P		
Solid waste compost facility			C	C	✓
Solid waste transfer station			P	C	
Tire retreading		P	P	P	
<b>Accessory Uses</b>					
Accessory use	P	P	P	P	

(C.F. No. 05-441, § 2, 8-24-05; Ord. No. 06-112, § 2, 2-22-06; C.F. No. 07-633, § 3, 8-15-07; C.F. No. 08-640, § 6, 7-9-08; C.F. No. 09-341, § 6, 4-22-09; Ord. No. 10-33, 10-27-10)



## Industrial Restricted (IR) Zoning design standards edits – Staff

**DRAFT**, revised 9/28/11 (annotated version)

*LP drafting notes: Saint Paul PED and DSI started with 66.542, required conditions in IR, and explicitly spelled out the recent Traditional Zoning Design standards edits. Then the staff team began making additional edits based on staff discussions on 8/12/11, 9/7/11, 9/21/11, and 9/28/11.*

*We incorporated language from Port Authority covenants 3.6 (Building configuration) into 66.542(3) building articulation (#2).*

*We modeled a draft new section (#3) regarding door and window openings on 63.110(b), requiring standards for office portions but NOT non-office portions of buildings. We added to this section language from Saint Paul Port Authority covenant 3.6.9 regarding windows, glazing, and daylighting.*

*The following design standards are proposed for IR but it is possible that some of these elements could be applied to I1-zoned areas as well.*

### **DRAFT text amendments to 66.542:**

**Sec. 66.542. - Required conditions in the IR Light industrial restricted district.**

(a) *Design standards.* Development shall be consistent with the following design standards unless the applicant can demonstrate that there are circumstances unique to the property that make compliance impractical or unreasonable:

(1) Buildings anchor the corner. In pedestrian-oriented areas characterized by buildings located up to the public sidewalk, at intersections buildings shall "hold the corner," that is, have street facades within fifteen (15) feet of the lot line along both streets, or the site plan shall include pedestrian-oriented elements such as substantial landscaping, public art, monument signage, and vertical structural elements that "hold the corner."

CITY STAFF IS REVIEWING THE DEFINITIONS OF "PEDESTRIAN-ORIENTED AREAS" AND "SUBSTANTIAL", AS WELL AS THE PROPOSED REQUIREMENT THAT FACADES BE LOCATED WITHIN 15 FEET OF THE LOT LINE OF THE PUBLIC STREETS.

(2) Building facade articulation. The bottom 25 feet of building facades facing a public street shall include human-scale elements such as doors and windows, texture, projections, awnings and canopies, ornament, vertical or horizontal variations in color, texture, and material, and/or ornamentation-etc. Straight wall sections of buildings facing a public street shall not exceed two (2) structural column bays, or 80 feet, without articulation. Examples of articulation include offset or recessed structural bays, projecting elements such as colonnades or bay windows, or other roof or wall features.

STAFF IS STUDYING A MORE PRECISE WAY TO DESCRIBE "PUBLIC STREET," OR THE FRONTAGE OF THE BUILDING. IN ADDITION, STAFF IS STUDYING THE PROPOSED REQUIREMENT THAT THERE BE ARTICULATION ON BUILDING FACADES AT LEAST EVERY 80 FEET.

**Comment [LP1]:** Replaces IR reference to Sec. 66.343(b)(6) Buildings anchor the corner, to specify minimum street facade setbacks from a corner for buildings within pedestrian-oriented areas. New language parallels §63.110, Building Design Standards standard (c), which also specifies alternatives to meeting the front setback requirement, including the provision of more specific "vertical structural elements that 'hold the corner.'"

**Comment [LP2]:** Updates and modifies IR reference to Sec. 66.343(b)(9) Building facade articulation, with a more specific intent of breaking up large industrial facades (80 feet is maximum permitted without articulation). New specific language mirrors Port Authority covenants Sec 3.6 (Building configuration).

(3) Door and window openings. For office portions of principal buildings, above grade window and door openings shall comprise at least fifteen (15) percent of the total area of exterior walls facing a public street. Such windows shall be clear or translucent to improve visibility, add visual interest, and provide daylighting of interior spaces.

**Comment [LP3]:** Replaces IR reference to Sec. 66.343(b)(13) Door and window openings – minimum and character, to focus solely on the office portions of principal buildings (instead of a requirement of 50% of the length and 30% of the area of ground floor facades of commercial/civic buildings). New language parallels §63.110, Building Design Standards standard (b), which exempts industrial, production, processing, storage, public service, and utility buildings, but requires principal buildings to have 15% of the total area of exterior walls facing a public street or sidewalk to be windows and door openings.

STAFF IS CONTINUING TO STUDY THE PROPOSED REQUIREMENT FOR TYPES OF GLASS SO THAT THERE IS A BALANCE BETWEEN DAYLIGHT AND ENERGY CONSERVATION.

(4) Materials and detailing. Buildings shall be constructed of high-quality materials such as brick, stone, textured cast stone, tinted masonry units, concrete, including glass or architectural metal. The following materials are generally not acceptable:

- Unadorned plain or painted concrete block;

- Tilt-up concrete panels;

- Synthetic stucco products;

- Corrugated metal;

- Reflective glass; and

- Vinyl, fiberglass, asphalt or fiberboard siding.

b. All building facades visible from a public street or walkway shall employ materials and design features similar to those of the front façade.

**Comment [LP4]:** Updates IR reference to Sec. 66.343(b)(14) Materials and detailing, to focus more narrowly on industrial/office building types to add in "architectural" to "metal," as a permitted material, as well as eliminate "tilt up concrete panels" from the list of proscribed materials.

STAFF IS REVIEWING WHETHER TO INCLUDE ONLY THE PROHIBITED MATERIALS, ON THE ASSUMPTION THAT ALL OTHER MATERIALS WOULD BE PERMITTED.

(5) Parking location and design. Surface parking shall be located to the side or to the rear of principal buildings to the greatest extent possible, or on a separate lot in compliance with Section 63.304. In reviewing a site plan, the zoning administrator may permit up to two (2) rows of parking spaces between the principal building and a street.

**Comment [LP5]:** Replaces/simplifies IR condition in Sec. 66.542 (a) Placement of parking; simplifies condition to remove provision that states that for more than two (2) rows of parking, applicants must go to the Planning Commission and notify owners of property within 350 feet of the parking spaces within at least ten (10) days before approval of the site plan, and their comments are considered. Also replaces IR reference to Sec. 66.343 (b)(18) Parking location and design.

(6) Landscaping and street trees. Landscaping shall be provided along the public streets and sidewalks to define the street edge, buffer pedestrians from vehicles, and provide shade. Any fence along a public street and sidewalk shall be decorative (not including chainlink). Street trees in the street right-of-way, as prescribed by the city forester and section 69.600 of the subdivision regulations, shall be provided along all streets. Street trees shall be located in a planting strip at least five (5) feet wide between the curb and sidewalk, or in structural soil or its equivalent.

**Comment [LP6]:** Replaces IR reference to Sec. 66.343 (b)(22) Street trees. Also discusses private or other landscaping along public streets and sidewalks that may have the same function as street trees (define the street edge, buffer pedestrians, etc.)

STAFF IS CONTINUING TO DISCUSS THE TYPES OF FENCING THAT SHOULD BE REQUIRED.

(7) Sidewalks. When redevelopment occurs, public streets shall be designed with a public sidewalk along the frontage of the property being developed.

**Comment [LP7]:** Replaces IR reference to Sec. 66.343(b)(23) Sidewalks, which repeats sidewalk design standards from elsewhere in the Code and requires sidewalks on both sides of public streets (instead of discussing property frontage wh ... [1])



(b) *Park Setbacks.* In any yard which adjoins a publicly owned park, buildings may be constructed at the lot line subject to setbacks being provided in accordance with the table below:

STAFF IS STUDYING WHETHER BUILDING HEIGHTS SHOULD BE NOTED IN FEET, RATHER THAN STORIES.

Building Height (stories)	Setback from Lot Line
1, 2, and 3	0
4	15 feet
5	30 feet
6 and over	45 feet

**Recommendations for applying certain design standards to I1 as well:**

Recommended:

**Door and window openings.** *Yes. This would only apply to office portions of principal buildings.*

**Landscaping and street trees.**

**Sidewalks.**

Not recommended:

**Parking location and design.** *Many industrial sites are larger and have more intensive production/manufacturing onsite. More intense production activities have larger external impacts (noise, vibration, etc.). Larger setbacks, more off-street parking, and more truck traffic are likely and in some cases appropriate.*

**Building articulation.** *This could add a lot of cost to a large, industrial building.*

**Parking lot lighting.** *The staff discussion concluded that lighting standards were less important for the interior of the site – including lighting within parking lots and along interior sidewalks and walkways – and more important along the public right-of-way, including the sidewalk.*

*For our reference:*

**Sec. 63.110. - Building design standards.**

(a) A primary entrance of principal structures shall be located within the front third of the structure; be delineated with elements such as roof overhangs, recessed entries, landscaping, or similar design features; and have a direct pedestrian connection to the street. In addition, for one- and two-family dwellings, a primary entrance shall either: 1) face an improved abutting street; or 2) be located off of a front porch, foyer, courtyard, or similar architectural feature, and set back at least eight (8) feet from the side lot line.

(b) For principal buildings, except industrial, production, processing, storage, public service and utility buildings, above grade window and door openings shall comprise at least fifteen (15) percent of the total area of exterior walls facing a public street or sidewalk. In addition, for new principal residential buildings, above grade window and door openings shall comprise at least ten (10) percent of the total area of all exterior walls. Windows in garage doors shall count as openings; the area of garage doors themselves shall not count as openings. For residential buildings, windows shall be clear or translucent. For nonresidential buildings, windows may be clear, translucent, or opaque.

(c) In pedestrian-oriented commercial districts characterized by storefront commercial buildings built up to the public sidewalk, new principal structures shall have a maximum setback of fifteen (15) feet from a commercial front lot line. At intersections, buildings shall "hold the corner," that is, have street facades within fifteen (15) feet of the lot line along both streets, or the site plan shall have vertical structural elements that "hold the corner." A primary entrance shall face a primary abutting public street.

(d) Building materials and architectural treatments used on sides of buildings facing an abutting public street should be similar to those used on principal facades.

(e) The visibility of rooftop mechanical equipment shall be reduced through such means as location, screening, or integration into the roof design. Screening shall be of durable, permanent materials that are compatible with the primary building materials. Exterior mechanical equipment such as ductwork shall not be located on primary building facades.

(f) For property with local historic site or district designation, compliance with applicable historic guidelines shall be sufficient to meet the requirements of this section.